

# GOLD STANDARD LOCAL STAKEHOLDER CONSULTATION REPORT OF ADARES WIND POWER PLANT

HELD ON:06.07.2013/16:00 IN: Acarlar Village/Selçuk/İzmir/Turkey

### CONTENTS



### A. Project Description

- 1. Title of the project activity
- 2. Project eligibility under Gold Standard
- 3. Current project status

### B. Design of Stakeholder Consultation Process

- 1. Description of physical meeting(s)
  - i. Agenda
  - ii. Non-technical summary
  - iii. Invitation tracking table
  - iv. Text of individual invitations
  - v. Text of public invitations
- 2. Description of other consultation methods used

### **C.** Consultation Process

- 1. Participants' in physical meeting(s)
  - i. List
  - ii. Evaluation forms
- 2. Pictures from physical meeting(s)
- 3. Outcome of consultation process
  - i. Minutes of physical meeting(s)
  - ii. Minutes of other consultations
  - iii. Assessment of all comments
  - iv. Revisit sustainable development assessment
  - v. Summary of changes to project design based on comments

### D. Sustainable Development Assessment

- 1. Own sustainable development assessment
  - i. 'Do no harm' assessment
  - ii. Sustainable development matrix
- 2. Stakeholders blind sustainable development matrix
- 3. Consolidated sustainable development matrix

### E. Sustainability Monitoring Plan

- 1. Discussion on Sustainability monitoring Plan
- 2. Discussion on continuous input / grievance mechanism

### F. Description of Stakeholder Feedback Round

Annex 1. Original participants list



### Annex 2. Original feedback forms

### SECTION A. PROJECT DESCRIPTION

**A. 1. Title of the project activity** Title: Adares Wind Power Plant Date: 06.07.2013 Version no.:2

### A. 2. Project eligibility under the Gold Standard

### [See Toolkit 2.2 and Annex C]

Adares Wind Power Plant is eligible as a Gold Standard project according to the Gold Standard Requirements v2.2 due to following conditions:

- 1. Adares Wind Power Plant will have a power capacity of 10 MW and the yearly reduction of CO<sub>2</sub> emissions by the project will be 25.000 tons. Therefore, according to the CDM rules, the project is considered as a small-scale project satisfying rule for "*Type (i): renewable energy project activities with a maximum output capacity equivalent to up to 15 megawatts (or an appropriate equivalent)*".<sup>1</sup>
- 2. Even if Turkey has ratified the Kyoto Protocol<sup>2</sup>, Turkey has no mandatory emission cap and instituted DNA to provide letter of approval (LoA) for VERs. Therefore, the project is to be assessed as a VER project. However, in the near future, the project might be registered in the database of the Ministry of Environment and Urbanization.

Please see below the legal notices and announcements of the Ministry of Environment and Urbanization:

- <u>http://www.resmigazete.gov.tr/main.aspx?home=http://www.resmigazete.gov.tr/eskiler/2010/08/20100807.htm&main=http://www.resmigazete.gov.tr/eskiler/2010/08/20100807.htm</u>
- <u>http://www.resmigazete.gov.tr/main.aspx?home=http://www.resmigazete.gov.tr/eskiler/2011/10/20111022.htm&main=http://www.resmigazete.gov.tr/eskiler/2011/10/20111022.htm</u>
- <u>http://iklim.cob.gov.tr/iklim/New%20folder/karbonkayıt.pdf</u>
- 3. The project is a renewable energy project.
- 4. The project will reduce CO<sub>2.</sub>
- 5. The project will not receive an ODA.

From the beginning of the project, the project has been announced to be launched and operated with the revenues from the sales of GS VERs.

The project received an operating license by the Energy Market Regulatory Authority

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup><u>http://www.cdmrulebook.org/152</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup>Turkey ratified the Kyoto Protocol on 26th of August 2009. However, Turkey is neither a CDM nor a JI host country.<u>http://unfccc.int/kyoto\_protocol/items/2830.php</u>

(EMRA) and EIA exemption certificate. Loan agreement and electromechanical equipment agreement is expected to be completed before the beginning of 2014 and construction works will be started just after completion of these agreements. Finally it is planned that the project will generate electricity by the Q3 2014

# A. 3. Current project status

Adares Wind Power Plant is still in the development phase. The project has received a 10 MW production license from EMRA (Electricity Market Regulatory Authority) and EIA exemption. However, loan agreement and equipment procurement has not been completed and construction works has not been started yet.

### SECTION B. DESIGN OF STAKEHOLDER CONSULTATION PROCESS

### B. 1. Design of physical meeting(s)

### i. Agenda

Date, time: 6th of July, 2013, Saturday, 16:00

Location: Acarlar Village Café /Acarlar Village, Selçuk, İzmir

- 1. Opening of the meeting
- 2. Explanation of the project
- 3. Questions for clarification about the project
- 4. Blind SD exercise
- 5. Discussion of continuous input /grievance mechanism
- 6. Discussion on monitoring SD
- 7. Closure of the meeting

### ii. Non-technical summary



### ADARES WIND ENERGY POWER PLANT

### **GHG EMISSION REDUCTION PROJECT**

YGT Elektrik Üretim Sanayi Ticaret Ltd. Şti. (hereafter referred to as "project proponent") is targeting to build a 10 MW wind energy power plant (hereafter referred to as the "project") in Selçuk, about 81 kilometres south of the city İzmir.

The proposed project activity will reduce greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions by using electricity from a renewable energy source instead of a fossil fuel and therefore displacing electricity which otherwise would have been generated by thermal power plants connected to the national grid. As a result, about 25.000 tons of  $CO_2$  emissions, which are harmful to the climate, are expected to be reduced by this climate-friendly technology, which otherwise would have been generated by a fossil fuel power plant and released to the atmosphere.

The proposed project activity will significantly contribute to the sustainable development of the region by achieving following benefits:

- Wind energy is a renewable energy source and thus, an energy resource that is continually replenished. Therefore, wind energy is not in conflict with the availability of energy for future generations, which is true for fossil fuels.
- As compared to the business-as-usual scenario (using fossil fuel for electricity production) in Turkey, reduction of greenhouse gas emissions (GHG) including carbon dioxide (CO<sub>2</sub>) or nitrous oxide (N<sub>2</sub>O). This will positively contribute to environment and climate protection.
- In addition to that, as compared to fossil-fuel power plants, other air emissions such as sulfur dioxide or particulates will be reduced, which will improve air quality for the local people.
- Replacement of fossil fuel generation and positive contribution to the use of climate-friendly electricity generation technologies and renewable energy mix in Turkey.
- Stimulation and commercialization of the use of grid connected renewable energy technologies and markets.
- Improvement of local livelihoods by creating local employment during the construction and operation phase of the facility.
- Contribution to the decrease of Turkey's energy deficit and import dependency on fossil fuels.

The proposed project activity received an operating license by the Energy Market Regulatory Authority (EMRA) on 12.05.2011. The loan agreement and electromechanical

equipment agreement is expected to be made in Q4 2013. The estimated commencement date of construction of the facility is Q1 2014. The estimated start of operation of the facility is Q3 2014.

**Aim of The Meeting:** In order to make the Project economically viable, it is required to gain additional income from the sales of the generated Verified Emissions Reductions (VERs) certificates approved by The Gold Standard Foundation. Therefore, The Gold Standard application process has been initiated. Organizing a Local Stakeholder Consultation Meeting with the participation of local stakeholders and NGOs is the next step of this process.

**Monitoring the Outcomes of The Meeting:** Local Stakeholder Consultation Meeting Report will be published on our web page (<u>www.green-cf.com</u>) and open to comments with other complementary documents of the project for two months.

# TURKISH VERSION OF THE NON-TECHNICAL SUMMARY

### ADARES RÜZGAR ENERJİ SANTRALİ

### SERA GAZI EMİSYON AZALTIM PROJESİ

YGT Elektrik Üretim Sanayi Ticaret Ltd. Şti. (bundan sonra proje sahibi olarak anılacaktır) İzmir'in 81 km güneyinde kalan Selçuk İlçesi'nde 10 MW gücüne sahip bir rüzgar enerji üretim santrali (bundan böyle "proje" olarak anılacaktır) kurmayı hedeflemektedir.

Proje, fosil yakıt kullanan termik santrallerin tersine, yenilenebilir enerji kaynağı kullanarak elektrik üreterek ulusal şebekeye verecek ve sera gazı emisyonlarını azaltacaktır. Sonuç olarak iklim dostu olan bu teknoloji ile iklim için zararlı olan yaklaşık 25.000 ton karbon dioksit salınımı azaltılacaktır.

Proje aşağıdaki faydaları sağlayarak bölgenin sürdürülebilir kalkınmasına önemli katkılar sağlayacaktır:

- Rüzgar enerjisi sürekli tazelenen bir yenilenebilir enerji kaynağıdır. Bu sebeple fosil yakıtların sebep olduğu gibi gelecek nesiller için enerjiye erişim konuşunda çatışmaya yol açmaz.
- Türkiye'deki sıradan iş pratikleri (elektrik üretimi için fosil yakıtların kullanılması) ile karşılaştırıldığında karbondioksit (CO2) veya azot oksit (N2O) içeren sera gazı salınımlarını azaltır. Bu da, çevrenin ve iklimin korunmasına olumlu katkıda bulunur.
- Buna ek olarak, fosil yakıt kullanan enerji santralleri ile karşılaştırıldığında, kükürt dioksit ve partiküller gibi diğer emisyonlar azaltılacak ve bu yerel halkın hava kalitesini yükseltecektir.

- Şebeke bağlantılı yenilenebilir enerji teknolojileri ve piyasaların kullanımının teşvik edilmesi ve ticarileştirilmesi.
- Tesisin inşaat ve işletme aşamasında yerel istihdam yaratarak yerel geçim kaynaklarının geliştirilmesi.
- Türkiye'nin enerji açığı ve fosil yakıtlara olan ithalat bağımlılığının azalma katkı sağlanması

Projeye Enerji Piyasası Düzenleme Kurulu (EPDK) tarafından 12.05.2011 tarihinde işletim lisansı verilmiştir. Finansman ve elektromekanik ekipman anlaşmasının 2013 yılını 4. çeyreğinde yapılması bekleniyor. Tahmini olarak projenin yapımına 2014 yılının 1. çeyreğinde başlanacak ve 2014 yılının 3. çeyreğinde de işletime geçilecektir.

**Toplantının Amacı:** Bu Proje'nin ekonomik olarak varlığının devam ettirilebilmesi için Gold Standard Foundation tarafından onaylanan Emisyon Azaltım Kredileri'nin (VERs) satışından elde edilecek gelire ihtiyaç duyulmaktadır. Bu nedenle Gold Standard Foundation'a başvuru süreci başlatılmıştır. Bu sürecin bir sonraki aşaması yerel halk ve sivil toplum kuruluşlarının katılımıyla gerçekleştirilecek olan Yerel Halk Danışma Toplantısı (LSC Meeting) düzenlemektir.

**Toplantı Sonuçlarının İzlenmesi**: Yerel Paydaşlar Danışma Toplantısı Raporu diğer proje dokümanları ile birlikte ilerleyen zamanda en az 2 ay boyunca web sitemizde (www.green-cf.com) görüşlerinize sunulacaktır.

### iii. Invitation tracking table

[See Toolkit 2.6 and Annex J]

Category code	Organisation (if relevant)	Name of invitee	Way of invitation	Date of invitation	Confirmation received? Y/N
A	Municipality of Selçuk	Mayor Hüseyin Vefa Ülgür	Fax	21.06.2013	Y
A	Sultaniye Village	Mukhtar Çetin Mermer	Visit	19.06.2013	Y
A	Acarlar Village	Mukhtar Ramazan İğneci	Visit	19.06.2013	Y



A	Çamlık Village	Mukhtar Mehmet Eryıldız	Visit	19.06.2013	Y
A	Dost Medya	Hilmi Gider	E- mail/Phone Call	26.06.2013	Y
В	Governorate of Selçuk	Governor Ayhan Boyacı	Fax	21.06.2013	Y
В	Directorate of Selçuk Tourism Information	Director Mehmet Falakalı	Fax	21.06.2013	Y
В	Selçuk County Health Directorate	Director İsmail Yalçın	Fax	21.06.2013	Y
В	Selçuk District Directorate of Agriculture	Director Yunus Öztürk	Fax	24.06.2013	Y
В	Selçuk Directorate of Education	Director Özer Baki Şimşek	Fax	24.06.2013	Y
В	Directorate of Selçuk Public Training Center	Director Nuri Gökgöz	Fax	24.06.2013	Y
В	Operation Director of Selçuk Aerodrome	Director Murtaza Turan	Fax	24.06.2013	Y
В	Selçuk Aviation Training Center	Head Muzaffer Karaca	Fax	24.06.2013	Y
C	Ministry of Environment and Urban Planning- Department of Climate Change	Tuba Seyyah	Fax	24.06.2013	Y



D	Directorate of Selçuk Agricultural Sales Cooperatives	Director Ali İhsan Karadu- man	Fax	24.06.2013	Y
D	Selçuk Chamber of Commerce	President Koray Yolcu	Fax	21.06.2013	Y
D	Selçuk Chamber of Agriculture	President İbrahim Erdallı	Fax	24.06.2013	Y
D	Selçuk Hunters and Shooters Association	President Fadıl Lale	Phone Call	24.06.2013	Y
D	İzmir Chamber of Environmental Engineers	President Emine Helil İnay Kinay	E- mail/Phone Call	26.06.2013	Y
D	REC Turkey	Gülnaz Akşahin	E-mail	19.06.2013	Y
E	The Gold Standard Foundation	Bahar Ubay	E-mail	19.06.2013	Y
F	WWF Turkey	Eren Atak	E-mail	19.06.2013	Y
F	Green Peace Mediterranean	Hilal Atıcı	E-mail	19.06.2013	N
F	Helio International	Helene O'Connor- Lajambe	E-mail	19.06.2013	N
F	REEEP	Katrin Harvey	E-mail	19.06.2013	Y
F	Mercy Corps		E-mail	19.06.2013	Ν

Sultaniye Village is the closest settlement to the project location. However, due to the very few residents in the village and lack of meeting place the meeting was hold in the Acarlar Village which is second closest settlement to the project area. Additionally, in

order to facilitate access of the stakeholders to the meeting place, the project owner organised a shuttle midibus service from the villages Sultaniye and Çamlık to Acarlar Village.

From category A, Mayor of Selçuk Municipality, mukhtars of Sultaniye, Acarlar and Çamlık village were invited since they are the official representatives of local stakeholders. Dost media is the local media company which would contribute to the announcement of the meeting.

From Category B, representatives of 8 governmental offices were innited. All these offices were located in Selçuk District.

Since the Department Head on Climate Change under the Ministry of Environment and Urbanization acting as national focal point on climate change and UNFCCC, this authority was invited in the scope of Category C.

6 local NGOs which would be directly or indirectly related with the subject were invited in the scope of Category C.

Ms. Bahar Ubay, the local expert of the Gold Standard Foundation, was invited but due to some other arrangements on the same date she could not attend to the meeting.

WWF Turkey, Greenpeace Mediterranean, Helio International, REEEP and Mercy Corps were invited in scope of category F.

Apart from these invitations, We tried to reach as many stakeholders as we could via different kinds of communication ways such as local newspaper ads, mosque megaphones and announcements on the village cafes.

### iv. Text of individual invitations

### Dear Ms. Ubay,

**YGT Elektrik Üretim Sanayi Ticaret Ltd.Şti.** (in the following YGT) is planning to invest in a wind power plant ("Project") in Selçuk District of İzmir Province, Turkey. The aim of the Project is to generate clean electricity for Turkish Grid. The environmental assessment of the Project is completed but the technical and financial assessment of the Project is ongoing. Please find the non-technical summary of the project enclosed. In order to make the Project economically viable, it is required to gain additional income from the sales of the generated Verified Emissions Reductions (VERs) certificates approved by The Gold Standard Foundation. Therefore, The Gold Standard application process has been initiated. Organizing a Local Stakeholder Meeting with the participation of local stakeholders and NGOs is the next step of this process. Thus, we, as Green Consult and Finance on behalf of YGT, kindly invite you to participate this meeting which will be held on **6**<sup>th</sup> of July, 2013, at 16:00, at village café in Acarlar Village, Selçuk District, İzmir.

The agenda of the meeting is as below;



A. Opening of the meeting

- B. Explanation of the project
- C. Questions for clarification about project explanation
- D. Blind sustainable development exercise
- E. Discussion on continuous input/grievance mechanism
- F. Discussion on monitoring sustainable development
- G. Closure of the meeting

We kindly ask you to confirm your participation to the following telephone number: +90 535 356 68 20 before 4<sup>th</sup> of July, 2013 or if you are not able to attend please share your comments to the following address or send us an e-mail.

E-mail: <a href="mailto:yalcin.yilmaz@green-cf.com">yalcin.yilmaz@green-cf.com</a>

Address: Cevizlidere Mah. 1066. Cad. No: 44/1 Çankaya - Ankara - TURKEY

Yours Sincerely,

Yalçın YILMAZ Managing Partner

SAMPLE INVITATION FAX MESSAGE



# Mesaj Onay Raporu

# 21-HAZ-2013 15:07 CUM

Faks Numarasi: 03124737235 Ad : MRS

Influence. Innovate. Inspire.

www.cdmgoldstandard.org

Ad/Numara	:	02328928284
Sayf	:	2
Baş.Zamani	:	21-HAZ-2013 15:06 CUM
Geçen Siire	:	01'02"
Mod	:	STD ECM
Sonuçlar	:	[ O. K]

#### Selçuk Belediye Başkanı Sayın Hüseyin Vefa Ülgür,

YGT Elektrik Üretim Sanayi Ticaret Ltd.Şti. (bundan böyle YGT olarak anılacaktır.) İzmir'in Selçuk İlçesi'nde rüzgar enerji santrali("Proje") kurmayı planlamaktadır. Proje'nin amacı şebekeye temiz elektrik enerjisi sağlamaktır. Proje'nin çevre etki değerlendirmesi yapılmış, teknik ve finansal değerlendirme süreci devam etmektedir. Bu Proje'nin ekonomik olarak varlığının devam ettirilebilmesi için Gold Standard Foundation tarafından onaylanan Emisyon Azaltım Kredileri'nin (VERs) satışından elde edilecek gelire ihtiyaç duyulmaktadır. Bu nedenle Gold Standard Foundation'a başvuru süreci başlatılmıştır. Bu sürecin bir sonraki aşaması yerel halk ve sivil toplum kuruluşlarının katılımıyla gerçekleştirilecek olan Verel Paydaşlar Danışma Toplantısı (LSC Meeting) düzenlemektir. Bu amaçla biz Green Consult and Finance olarak Proje sahibi YGT adına 06 Temmuz 2013 tarihinde saat 16:00'da Selçuk İlçesi Acarlar Köyü kahvehanesinde gerçekleştiriceeğimiz bu toplantıya katılımınızı bekliyoruz.

#### Toplantı programı aşağıdadır;

- A. Toplantı açılışı
- B. Proje tanıtımı
- C. Projeye yönelik soruların alınması
- D. Sürdürülebilir etki değerlendirmesi
- E. Sürekli bildirim/şikayet mekanizması üzerine tartışma
- F. Sürdürülebilirliğin denetlenmesine yönelik tartışma
- G. Kapanış

Toplantiya katılanınızı lütfen en geç **4 Temmuz 2013** tarihine kadar 0535 356 68 20 numaralı telefon numarası ile tarafimiza bildiriniz. Toplantıya katılamamasız durumunda Proje ile ilgili yorumlarınızı aşağıda belirtilen adrese veya e-mail adresine gönderebilirsiniz.

E-mail: yalcin.yilmaz@green-cf.com Adres: Cevizlidere Mah. 1066. Cad. No: 44/3 Çankaya - Ankara

Saygılarımla,

Yalçın YILMAZ Yönctici Ortak

#### **SAMPLE INVITATION E-MAIL**



M 0 0 + 4 17	Land Stababelian Masting for Alama W77 - Boli (4754)	Co-B-mil
Trans. Bati		u u
Initiative (36.6.30.5.10.4.3 features letting)      nature Galger TUVAZ - carbon yinas Spreen of some     initian Distance Spreen of some     initian Distance Spreen of some     initian Distance Spreen of some     initian Distance Spreen of some     initian Distance Spreen of some		Tarih: 1946-2012 Carid
Line Anton Technical Summary, Adares (VDPF doc 37 KB)		
Dear Ms. Ulwg.		
for Turkish Grid. The environmental assessment of the Project onter to make the Project oconomically viable, it is required to a Therefore, The Gold Standard application process has been initi	In planning to invest is a wind power plant ("Peripart") in Selopk District of Israel Province, Tarkey, Th transplated but the technical and financial assessment of the Project is orgoning. Planse find the non all additional income fram the takes of the generated (varials environment Reductions (VER) participa- reductions) income fram the takes of the generated (varials environment Reductions (VER) participa- reductions) income fram the takes of the generated (varials environment) and (VER) participations) in the second second second second in the second sec	utechnical summary of the project enclosed. In les approved by The Gold Standard Foundation. the next step of this process. Thus, we, as Green
A. Oppning of the meeting B. Exploration of the project C. Questions for classification about project explanati D. Bind massinelle development exercise E. Discussion on continuous input getwance mechan F. Discussion on continuous input getwance mechan F. Discussion on manifording sumainable developmen O. Classate of the meeting	in.	
We kindly ask you to confirm your participation to the follow address or send us an e-mail	ring telephone number: 190 333 336 68 20 before II* of July, 2013 or if you are not able to atte	ad please thate your comments to the following
Frenzill - <u>valcin vibnaz Berenard com</u> Address: Cavitildare Mah. 1965, Cad. No: 44/1 Çavkaya - Ankara	TURCEY	
Your Sincerely,		
		teach providences

### v. Text of public invitations



### D. Blind sustainable development exercise

- E. Discussion on continuous input/grievance mechanism
- F. Discussion on monitoring sustainable development
- G. Closure of the meeting

### **Organizer of the Meeting:**

YGT Elektrik Üretim Sanayi Ticaret Ltd.Şti. on behalf of FC Holding

&

Green Consult and Finance

### **Contact Information:**

Yalçın YILMAZ

Tel: +90 312-473 0399

Faks: +90 312-473 7235

Mobil: +90 535-356 6820

E-mail: <u>yalcin.yilmaz@green-cf.com</u>

NEWSPAPER ANNOUNCEMENT AD





### B. 2. Description of other consultation methods used

In order to encourage people to make comments on the project, contact ways were explained in the announcements and invitation letter such as writing e-mail, calling or sending letters. However, we could not get any response from the stakeholders.

# SECTION C. CONSULTATION PROCESS

# C. 1. Participants' in physical meeting(s)

# i. List of participants

# [See Toolkit 2.6.1 and Annex J]

Please attach original participants' list (in original language) as Annex 1.

Participant	s list				
Date and ti	me: 06.07.2013 / 16:00				
Location: A	carlar Village Café / Selçı	uk / İzmir			
Category	Name of participant,	Male/	Signature	Organisation (if	Contact details
Code	job/ position in the	Female		relevant)	
	community				
А	Mustafa Rıfat Esen	Male		FC Enerji	0554 346 4910
А	Faruk Batur	Male		FC Enerji	0224 411 0304
А	Mehmet Bayraktar	Male		YGT Elektrik	0539 388 6704
А	Fuat Gülümser	Male		Ambulance	0232 892 3665
				(Emergency	
				Service Driver)	
А	Adnan Ercan	Male		Artisan	0536 981 9236
В	Mustafa Döner	Male		TEDAŞ	0506 309 2605
А	Ali Seyyah	Male		Farmer	0505 729 6438
А	M. Ali Tutgun	Male		Farmer	0539 294 0530
А	Sebahattin Seyyah	Male		Farmer	0532 506 7982
А	Ali Çırban	Male		Farmer	-
А	Osman Demirdağ	Male		Farmer	-
А	Hüseyin Öztürk	Male		Farmer	0232 892 7904
А	Esat Bayraktar	Male		Farmer	-
А	Meryem Bayraktar	Female		Farmer	-
А	Meliha Bayraktar	Female		Farmer	-
А	Brigette Edler	Female		Artist	0542 283 2813
А	Kurt Kopta	Male		Painter	-
А	Necla Çakmak	Female		Farmer	-



А	Emine Bahçebakan	Female	Farmer	-
А	Ramazan İğneci	Male	Mukhtar	0506 371 7561
A	Hakan Sönmez	Male	Farmer	0536 517 6722
А	Hasan Sönmez	Male	Farmer	0232 832 8817
A	Hayrittin Buz	Male	Worker	0232 892 0808
А	Ogün Yeşilçimen	Male	Artisan	0537 867 2292
A	Sema Yeşilçimen	Female	District Head of	0541 660 5939
			AK Parti	
D	İbrahim Akgün	Male	Selçuk Chamber	0538 717 2761
			of Agriculture	
D	Hasan Ali Albeyoğlu	Male	Selçuk Chamber	0532 497 5014
			of Agriculture	
D	Eyüp Kartal	Male	Retired	0542 512 9679

The number of the female participants was 6 and the number of male participants was 22 out of total 28 participants. Among the participants there was an Austrian couple who are settled in the Sultaniye Village.

Even though the participation level of locals was quite satisfactory, the number of the old and illiterate people was pretty high. We had to help them while filling the participation and evaluation forms.

Except Chamber of Agriculture, none of the local NGOs and governmental organisations were participated in the meeting though we sent fax and called them via phone.

### ii. Evaluation forms

### [See Toolkit 2.6.1, 2.6.2 and Annex J]

Please add at least 4-5 representative samples in English.

Please attach original evaluation forms (in original language) as Annex 2.

Name	Hasan Ali Albeyoğlu
What is your impression of the meeting?	Quite positive, the audience was informed as
	much as possible about the cleanliness and
	cheapness of the energy to be generated.
What do you like about the project?	Bringing the clean (renewable) and cheap energy,
	and its harmless effects deserve to be admired.
What do you not like about the project?	-



Signature

Name	Sema Yeşilçimen
What is your impression of the meeting?	I think It was a quite efficient meeting.
What do you like about the project?	It is important that the turbines will be settled in
	the forest and the state lands, and the power lines
	and the switch center are on the lands in the
	private ownership.
What do you not like about the project?	It should be environmental friendly and has no
	carcinogenic effect.
Signature	

Name	İbrahim Akgün
What is your impression of the meeting?	The speakers well know the subject, adopted the
	interests of the country and employment laws,
	and presents very well.
What do you like about the project?	A good step on the way of having green and clean
	energy.
What do you not like about the project?	-
Signature	

Name	Hayrittin Buz
What is your impression of the meeting?	Positive
What do you like about the project?	It is clean, and harmless to the environment.
What do you not like about the project?	No comment
Signature	

As it was mentioned above, the number of the illiterate people was quite compelling to collect the evaluation forms. In total we have gathered 12 evaluation forms at the meeting which is almost the half of the total participants. Apart from this, it can be easily infer from the evaluation forms that all comments were quite positive. The main concern of the participants was "whether they could use discounted electricity or not".

# C. 2. Pictures from physical meeting(s)







Influence. Innovate. Inspire. www.cdmgoldsfandard.org



### C. 3. Outcome of consultation process

### i. Minutes of physical meeting(s)

Please ensure that you include a summary of the meeting as well as all comments received. Please also include discussion on Continuous Input / Grievance Expression methods; comments, agreement or modifications suggested by Stakeholders.

### [See Toolkit 2.6, 2.6.1, 2.6.2, Annex W and Annex J]

The local stakeholders consultation meeting was held on 06.07.2013 at Acarlar Village Café, Selçuk, İzmir. Representatives of the local stakeholders, governmental organizations, local and international NGOs were invited via individual e-mail, fax message and phone call. The other stakeholders were invited via public invitations such as newspaper ad,, mosque megaphone announcement, and meeting announcements placed at the Village Cafes.

In order to facilitate the access of stakeholders to the meeting place, a shuttle service was organized by the project owner.

First, all participants were welcomed and non-technical summary of the project was distributed to the participants. The meeting started with an opening speech including agenda of the meeting and the aim of the meeting was explained. The representatives of the investor company introduced YGT Elektrik which is a subsidiary of FC Enerji and give information about the project. Then representatives of the project consultant company introduced Green Consult and Finance and explained the specific objectives of the project, the Clean Development Mechanism, Voluntary Carbon Market, and the Gold Standard Foundation.

After explanation of the project, the questions of the stakeholders were responded by the presenters. The most important concern of the stakeholders was whether they would get use of the discounted electricity sales. The comments and the responses are detailed in the section "C. 3. Outcome of consultation process- Part iii. Assessment of all comments" of this report.

At the next step, "do no harm assessment" was conducted and GS sustainable development indicator was evaluated one by one and the comments of the stakeholders were evaluated. First, the three categories of sustainable development were explained as environment, social development and technological & economic development and, the idea and scoring method for the blind sustainable development was explained to the stakeholders. Then, without giving any information about the indicators, they were asked to score each indicator as negative, neutral or positive. While they were scoring, comments of stakeholders were taken for each indicator and discussed together. Then, after the blind sustainable assessment exercise, the project participants explained their scoring for each indicator and gave justifications.

During the blind sustainable development exercise and active discussions, we saw that the only two differences between the stakeholders' assessment and the consultant's own sustainable development table was that (i) the stakeholders very interestingly scored the 'other pollutants' indicator as positive since their shared the view that the wind turbines would protect their village from sandstorms, and (ii) they also scored the "Balance of payments and investment" as positive since, even in a small size, they had the opinion that the project will positively contribute to the net EUR savings from the substitution of natural gas, imported from abroad.

However, the project participants could persuade the stakeholders to set both as neutral, as suggested by the presenters, since for (i) the monitoring is very difficult and for (ii) even the project results in a positive contribution, the net EUR savings are nevertheless in a very small amount that can be neglected. According to the active discussion between the stakeholders and the project participants, the consolidated sustainable development matrix had been finalized.

After the blind sustainable development exercise a discussion on continuous input / grievance mechanism was initiated and Continuous Input / Grievance Expression Process Book was decided to be given to the Mukhtar of Sultaniye Village. Therefore, the related contact information of the project owner and consultant were shared with the stakeholders.

The last part of the meeting contained the discussion of the monitoring of each positively consolidated sustainability indicator, the monitoring process and responsibilities of the project participant during that process.

At the end of the meeting, representatives of the investor company thanked to the stakeholders for their participation and the meeting was closed.

### ii. Minutes of other consultations

There were no other consultations other than the GS Local Stakeholder Meeting.

### iii. Assessment of all comments

[See Toolkit 2.6]

Stakeholder comment	Was comment taken into account (Yes/ No)?	Explanation (Why? How?)



Will the facility has a radioactive effect?	Yes	Wind power plants do not have such effects. This and these kind potential effects were evaluated at the Environmental Impact Assessment application.
Can we use discounted electricity?	YES	In macro scale, it is related with the number of renewable energy facilities into operation. Yet, by law, we are not allowed to supply electricity via a transmission line to the entities who would like to buy discounted electricity.
Can you organize a daily shuttle bus service to the project area that everybody can see the facility whenever they want? By doing this, you will also create an employment opportunity for the bus drivers of the region	NO	Since the high voltage lines will pass the project area, daily visits of the people will not be safe. On the other hand, in the construction and operation phase, some of local people will be employed.

### iv. Revisit sustainability assessment

Are you going to revisit the sustainable development assessment?	Yes	No
Please note that this is necessary when there are indicators scored 'negative' or if there are stakeholder comments that can't be mitigated		х
[See Toolkit 2.7]		

The main concern of the stakeholders was on discounted electricity usage. Representatives of the project owner explained the issue as this subject is more related with the liberalization of Turkish Electricity Market than the investment itself.

As a result, no concern was raised during the meeting which requires the revision of the



sustainability assessment.

### v. Summary of alterations based on comments

There were no comments of the local stakeholders that require any adjustment or change of the project.

### SECTION D. SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT ASSESSMENT

D. 1. Own sustainable development assessment

### i. 'Do no harm' assessment

[See Toolkit 2.4.1 and Annex H]

Safeguarding principles	Description of relevance to my project	Assessment of my project risks breaching it (low, medium, high)	Mitigation measure
A Human Rights			
<ol> <li>The project respects internationally proclaimed human rights including dignity, cultural property and uniqueness of indigenous people. The project is not complicit in Human Rights abuses.</li> </ol>	The project respects internationally proclaimed human rights including dignity, cultural property. Turkey is a member of the United Nations (UN) and part of UN Agreement on Human Rights. <sup>3</sup>	Low.	Not required, i.e., the PP accepts and applies the rules in UN Agreement on Human Rights.

<sup>3</sup><u>http://www.unicef.org/turkey/udhr/\_gi17.html</u>



2. The project does not involve and is not complicit in involuntary resettlement.	The project does not involve any resettlement of people. This is guaranteed by the "Law on Protection of Cultural and Environmental Assets". <sup>4</sup>	Low.	Not required, i.e., the PP accepts and applies the rules in Law on Protection of Cultural and Environmental Assets.
3. The project does not involve and is not complicit in the alteration, damage or removal of any critical cultural heritage.	The project will cause neither an alteration and damage nor a removal of any critical cultural heritage. These issues are guaranteed by the Law on "Law on Protection of Cultural and Environmental Assets". <sup>5</sup>	Low.	Not required, i.e., the PP accepts and applies the rules in Law on Protection of Cultural and Environmental Assets. In addition to that, according to annex "Comments of governmentalInstitutions" of the PIF, the Turkish Ministry of Culture and Tourism approves that the project will cause neither an alteration and damage nor a removal of any critical cultural heritage.
B Labour Standards			
4. The project respects the employees' freedom of association and their right to collective bargaining and is not complicit in restrictions of these freedoms and rights.	Employees are by law allowed to form associations or collectively bargain employment conditions. This is guaranteed by the Trade Union Act of Turkey No. 2821. <sup>6</sup>	Low.	Not required, i.e., the PP accepts and applies the rules in Trade Union Act of Turkey No. 2821.
5. The project does not involve and is not complicit in any form of	Project does not involve any form of forced or compulsory labor.	Low.	Not required, i.e., the PP accepts and applies the rules in Labor Act of

<sup>4</sup><u>http://mevzuat.basbakanlik.gov.tr/Metin.Aspx?MevzuatKod=1.5.2863&MevzuatIliski=0&sourceXmlSearch</u>

<sup>5</sup><u>http://mevzuat.basbakanlik.gov.tr/Metin.Aspx?MevzuatKod=1.5.2863&MevzuatIliski=0&sourceXmlSearch</u>

<sup>6</sup>http://www.ilo.org/public/english/region/eurpro/ankara/download/tradeunionsact.pdf



forced or compulsory labour.	This is guaranteed by the Labor Act of Turkey No. 4857. <sup>7</sup>		Turkey No. 4857.
6. The project does not employ and is not complicit in any form of child labour.	Project does not employ and is not complicit in any form of child labor. This is in compliance with Article 71 "Working age and restrictions on the employment of children" of Labor Law No. 4857. <sup>8</sup>	Low.	Not required, i.e., the PP accepts and applies Article 71 "Working age and restrictions on the employment of children" of Labor Law No. 4857.
7. The project does not involve and is not complicit in any form of discrimination based on gender, race, religion, sexual orientation or any other basis.	The project will not accept any kind of discrimination. This is guaranteed by Article 5 of the Labor Act of Turkey No. 4857 and ILO Convention 100&111 on "Equal Remuneration & Discrimination in Employment / Occupation". <sup>9</sup>	Low.	Not required, i.e., the PP accepts and applies Article 5 of the Labor Act of Turkey No. 4857 and ILO Convention 100&111 on "Equal Remuneration & Discrimination in Employment / Occupation"
8. The project provides workers with a safe and healthy work environment and is not complicit in exposing workers to unsafe or unhealthy work environments.	The project owner is committed to the safe and healthy working conditions during all phases of the project. All employees will undergo medical tests and attend trainings on first aid and health & safety. These issues are protected by Labor Law	Medium.	The project owner commits himself to ensure the safe and healthy working conditions during all phases of the project. All employees will undergo medical tests and attend trainings on first aid, health & safety as well as Emergency Response.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup>http://www.unicef.org/turkey/udhr/\_gi17.html;http://www.ilo.org/dyn/natlex/docs/SERIAL/64083/63017/F10 27431766/TUR64083.PDF

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup><u>http://www.unicef.org/turkey/udhr/\_gi17.html</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup><u>http://www.unicef.org/turkey/udhr/\_gi17.html; http://www.ilo.org/ilolex/english/convdisp1.htm</u>



	and regulations and UN		
	Agreement on Human Rights. <sup>10</sup>		
C Environmental Protection			
9. The Project takes a precautionary approach in regard to environmental challenges and is not complicity in practices contrary to the precautionary principle. This principle can be defined as: "When an activity raises threats of harm to human health or the environment, precautionary measures should be taken even if some cause and effect relationships are not fully established scientifically."	The project has applied the precautionary principles. The environment is protected by several Laws and Regulations in Turkey. The objective of the Environmental Law No. 2872 is to protect the environment with principles of sustainable development and environment. <sup>11</sup>	Medium.	During the construction and operation phase of the facility, environmental impacts (dust due to excavation, solid and liquid waste from personnel, air emissions etc.) will occur. However, the project takes a precautionary approach with regard to environmental challenges. Thus, as per PIF <sup>12</sup> , all the regulations in Turkey, which entered into force with the Environmental Law No. 2872 will be followed. Thus, the project owner commits himself to manage the waste and air emissions and apply measures, which are defined in PIF <sup>13</sup> , according to the various Turkish Laws and Regulation on Environment.
10. The project does not involve and is not complicit in significant conversion or degradation of critical natural habitats,	The project does not involve and is not complicity in significant conversion or degradation of critical	Low.	According to the PIF <sup>15</sup> , the project does not involve and is not complicity in significant conversion or degradation of critical natural habitats. Thus, no

<sup>10</sup><u>http://www.mevzuat.adalet.gov.tr/html/1243.html;</u> <u>http://www.unicef.org/turkey/udhr/\_gi17.html</u>

<sup>11</sup><u>http://mevzuat.basbakanlik.gov.tr/Metin.Aspx?MevzuatKod=1.5.2872&MevzuatIliski=0&sourceXmlSearch</u>=

<sup>12</sup> See Project Introduction File (PIF), page 5-17.

<sup>13</sup> See Project Introduction File (PIF), page 18-20.



including those that are (a) legally protected, (b) officially proposed for protection, (c) identified by authoritative sources for their high conservation value, or (d) recognized as protected by traditional local communities.	natural habitats. This is guaranteed by the Environmental Law No. 2872. <sup>14</sup>		mitigation measure is required.
D Anti-Corruption			
11. The project does not involve and is not complicit in corruption.	The project does not involve and is not complicit in corruption. It is guaranteed by law in Turkey that no action can not involve and is not complicit in corruption. <sup>16</sup> Turkey is a party to United Nation Convention against Corruption since 2006. <sup>17</sup>	Low.	Not required, i.e., the PP accepts and applies the rules in UN Convention against Corruption since 2006.

# ii. Sustainable development matrix

# [See Toolkit 2.4.2 and Annex I]

Indicator	Mitigation measure	Relevance to achieving MDG	Chosen parameter and explanation	Preliminary score
Gold	If relevant,	Check	Defined by	<u>Negative</u>

<sup>15</sup> See Project Introduction File (PIF), page 26-27.

<sup>14</sup><u>http://mevzuat.basbakanlik.gov.tr/Metin.Aspx?MevzuatKod=1.5.2872&MevzuatIliski=0&sourceXmlSearch</u>=

<sup>16</sup><u>http://www.anayasa.gen.tr/</u>

<sup>17</sup>http://ua.mfa.gov.tr/detay.aspx?1504



Standard indicators of sustainable development	copy mitigation measure from 'Do No Harm' assessment, and include mitigation measure used to neutralise a score of '-'	www.undp.org/mdg and www.mdgmonitor.org Describe how your indicator is related to local MDG goals	project developer	impact: score '-' in case negative impact is not fully mitigated, score '0' in case impact is planned to be fully mitigated <u>No change in impact</u> : score '0' <u>Positive</u> impact: score '+'
Air quality	N.A.	MDG- 7: Ensure Environment Sustainability: 7.A. Integrate the principles of sustainable development into country policies and programmes and reverse the loss of environmental resources.	Parameter: - Yearly electricity production in MWh; - Avoided amount of SOx and NOx; - Dust emissions during construction phase; - Emissions from construction machines during construction machines during construction phase The project will avoid SOx and NOx emissions and other emission types	0





such as PM (Particulates) or VOC , which otherwise would have been released by fossil fuel fired power plants, in the baseline. Thus, the air quality of the region, as compared to the baseline will be improved.
However, during the construction phase a negligible amount of emission from construction machines and dust emissions during the whole construction phase will occur. These all will be managed according to "Circular Exhaust Emission Measurements" <sup>18</sup> and "Regulation on
Excavation Construction and Demolition

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> <u>http://www.csb.gov.tr/db/denizli/icerikbelge/icerikbelge314.pdf</u>

			Waste Control" <sup>19</sup> . Therefore, the project's contribution to the improvement of the air quality for the region is considered as neutral as precautionary approach.	
Water quality and quantity	N.A.	MDG- 7: Ensure Environmental Sustainability: 7.C. Reduce by half the proportion of people without sustainable access to safe drinking water and basic sanitation	Parameter: N.A. As compared to the baseline, there will be no impact on any water resources and quality.	0
Soil condition	N.A.	MDG- 7: Ensure Environment Sustainability: 7.A. Integrate the principles of sustainable development into country policies and programmes and reverse the loss of environmental resources.	Parameter: N.A. As compared to the baseline, there will be no impact on the soil condition of the region. According to PIF <sup>20</sup> , the project is located in a region where agriculture is not possible. It is guaranteed that soil erosion will not occur.	0

<sup>19</sup> <u>http://www.mevzuat.gov.tr/Metin.Aspx?MevzuatKod=7.5.5401&MevzuatIliski=0&sourceXmlSearch=</u>
 <sup>20</sup> See Project Introduction File (PIF), page 21-22.



			Furthermore, the excavated soil during construction will be re-used for raising grass again. Parameter:	
Other pollutants	N.A.	MDG- 7: Ensure Environment Sustainability: 7.B. Reduce biodiversity loss, achieving, by 2010, a significant reduction in the rate of loss.	N.A. As compared to the baseline, no other pollutants will result. The closest settlement area is Acarlar Village, 1,450 m from the project area. Therefore, no negative effects such as noise, shadow flicker or electro- magnetic fields will come over Acarlar Village. <sup>21</sup> The transmission / distribution lines have neither an impact on destruction of vegetation nor on expropriation of land <sup>22</sup> .	0
Biodiversity	N.A.	MDG- 7: Ensure Environment	Parameter:	0

<sup>21</sup> See Project Introduction File (PIF), page 15 and page 20.
<sup>22</sup> See Project Introduction File (PIF), page 4-5.



<u>Sustainability:</u>	N.A.	
7.B. Reduce biodiversity loss, achieving, by 2010, a significant reduction in the rate of loss.	As compared to the baseline, there will be no change in biodiversity (species and habitat conservation).	
	In no case, the young trees and seedlings in the project area will be cut, but only removed from their place with	
	the appropriate technology and planted in a new location nominated by the Directorate	
	of Forestry. However, trees that cannot be disassembled and removed to another place	
	will be cut; this will only be a negligible amount <sup>23</sup> . The project	
	area is not located on bird migration route.	
	In the region, there are no faunal and floral species, as written and defied in the	

 $^{\rm 23}$  See Project Introduction File (PIF), page 4.



			Bern Agreement 9/1/1984, which have to be protected by law. Or, in other words, all the faunal and floral species in the project area, reported in detail in the PIF <sup>24</sup> , are not in the list of the Bern Agreement.	
Quality of employment	N.A.	MDG-1: Eradicate extreme poverty & hunger: 1.B. Achieve full and productive employment and decent work for all, including women and young people.	Parameter: - Number of issued certificates by the suppliers for the trainings on operation and maintenance (O&M) of the project equipment and units; - Number of health and safety trainings; Health and safety trainings for all the employees will be provided by the project owner. The employees will also be trained in O&M of the project equipment and	+

<sup>24</sup> See Project Introduction File (PIF), page 32-37.



			units by the machinery and equipment supplier. These jobs will have a significant impact on job quality,	
Livelihood of the poor	N.A.	MDG-1: Eradicate extreme poverty & hunger: 1.A. Reduce by half the proportion of people living on less than \$1 a day.	Parameter: N.A. As compared to the baseline, the project will have no impact on the livelihood of the poor in terms of access to health care services, access to sanitation services etc.	0
Access to affordable and clean energy services	N.A.	MDG- 7: Ensure Environment Sustainability: 7.A. Integrate the principles of sustainable development into country policies and programmes and reverse the loss of environmental resources. 7.2 CO2 emissions, total, per capita and per \$1 GDP (PPP)	Parameter: Amount of clean energy generated per year in MWh; The project will inject clean energy to the grid and therefore positively contribute to the decrease of the grids emission factor. This will improve the region's access to clean energy which is not	+

			possible in the baseline scenario of distributing fossil fuel based quantity of electricity. The project will also positively contribute to the reduction of dependency on fuel and energy imports.	
Human and institutional capacity	N.A.	MDG- 1: Eradicate extreme poverty & hunger: 1.A. Reduce by half the proportion of people living on less than \$1 a day.	Parameter: - Annual voluntary public awareness meetings for local stakeholders and participation certificates; The project owner will voluntarily provide yearly public awareness meetings (education) for local pupils and women. In these meetings the last status / developments on global climate change and carbon markets will be taught and discussed with the objective of regularly	+



	<b>The Gold Standard</b> Premium quality carbon credits
	Premium quality carbon credits

			informing them and proving a common panel for discussion. There will be made a short easy examination about their learned issues at the end of the education and certificates will be distributed to them. These will ensure and measure the sustainable benefit of these annual meetings This education will have a positive sustainable benefit to local stakeholders.	
Quantitative employment and income generation	N.A.	MDG- 1: Eradicate extreme poverty & hunger: 1.A. Reduce by half the proportion of people living on less than \$1 a day.	Parameter: Number of people with an employment contract / pay roll; The project will provide employment opportunities during the construction as well as the operation phase of the plant.	+



Balance of payments and investment	N.A.	MDG- 8: Develop a global partnership for development: 8.D. Deal comprehensively with the debt problems of developing countries.	Parameter: Avoided quantity of natural gas to be imported and the corresponding saved monetary value per year; The project will positively contribute to the replacement of fossil fuels and net foreign currency savings related to natural gas imports by shifting some of electricity generation away from natural gas towards using internally available renewable sources. However, due its relatively small size, the project's contribution is assumed not to have a significant impact on Turkey's balance of payments and investment (conservativene ss).	0
---	------	---	--	---



Technology transfer and technological self-reliance	N.A.	MDG- 8: Develop a global partnership for development: 8.F. In cooperation with the private sector, make available the benefits of new technologies, especially information and communications.	Parameter: N.A. The project will not have any contribution with regard to technology transfer and technological self-reliance for	0
			self-reliance for Turkey.	

Comments accompanying own sustainable development matrix

The project participant assessed the corresponding GS sustainability development (SD) indicator with 'neutral', where the project will result in no change with respect to the baseline.

The project participant set 6 of the SD indicators set as 'positive', indicating a positive impact on the environmental, social and technological / economical development. Although, very likely more SD indicators could have been set as "positive", we used a precautionary approach (i.e. to be conservative) and set them "neutral" due to the difficulty in illustrating strong enough empirical evidence, in measuring, quantifying and monitoring, respectively, of their absolutely positive impact.

Furthermore, the Government of Turkey and especially the UNDP representation in Turkey pay special attention to (local) MDGs.<sup>25</sup>

#### D. 2. Stakeholders Blind sustainable development matrix

#### [See Toolkit 2.6.1]

Indicator	Aitigation neasure	Relevance to achieving MDG	Chosen parameter and explanation	Preliminary score
-----------	-----------------------	-------------------------------	--	----------------------

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup><u>http://www.mdgmonitor.org/factsheets\_00.cfm?c=TUR&cd=792</u>



Gold Standard indicators of sustainable development	If relevant, copy mitigation measure from 'Do No Harm' assessment, and include mitigation measure used to neutralise a score of '-'	Check www.undp.org/ mdg and www.mdgmonito r.org Describe how your indicator is related to local MDG goals	Defined by project developer	Negative impact: score '-' in case negative impact is not fully mitigated, score '0' in case impact is planned to be fully mitigated <u>No change in impact</u> : score '0' <u>Positive</u> impact: score '+'
Air quality				+
Water quality and quantity				0
Soil condition				0
Other pollutants				+
Biodiversity				0
Quality of employment				+
Livelihood of the poor				+
Access to affordable and clean energy services				+
Human and institutional capacity				+



Quantitative employment and income generation		+
Balance of payments and investment		+
Technology transfer and technological self-reliance		N.A.

Comments resulting from the stakeholders blind sustainable development matrix

For each SD indicator 1-12, the stakeholders had the following views:

- 1. The project will have a 'positive' impact on the 'Air quality' in the region since wind energy is a clean and not harmful energy source as compared to fossil fuel type-fired power plants, which are also available in the region and polluting the air.
- 2. The project will have no impact on 'Water quality and quantity' ('neutral'), since the project will have no relation to water.
- 3. The project will have no impact on 'Soil condition' ('neutral'), since the project will have no relation to soil.
- 4. The project will have a 'positive' impact with regard to 'Other pollutants' since the wind turbines will protect the village from sandstorms coming from Sahara.
- 5. The project will have no impact on 'Biodiversity' ('neutral'), since the project has no relation to biodiversity of the region.
- 6. The project will have a 'positive' impact on 'Quality of employment' since the project participant, in addition to the creation of employment, will has to provide some training for their workers.
- 7. The project will have a 'positive' impact on 'Livelihood of the poor' since many people in the region will earn money for their families.
- 8. The project will have a 'positive' impact on 'access to affordable and clean energy services' since wind energy is a clean energy source.
- 9. The project will have a 'positive' impact on 'human and institutional capacity' since the project participant is expected to give meetings and presentations, such as the LSC meeting, to the local people also in future.
- 10. The project will have a 'positive' impact on 'quantitative employment and income generation' since during the construction and operational phase people will earn money. Also the local little companies such as cable assembly, construction materials, transporting companies etc. will earn money from the project.
- 11. The project will have a 'positive' impact on 'balance of payments and investment' since Turkey will be less dependent on imported natural gas and paying foreign debt by promoting wind energy and other renewable energy sources, which are available in Turkey.

12. The stakeholders had no idea about the impact on 'technology transfer and technological self-reliance' since they did not know if a new technology type of wind turbines will be used in this project, or if they will the same as they see and know from other wind energy project in the region. Thus, the SD indicator was set as 'N.A.'.

Give analysis of difference between own sustainable development matrix and the one resulting from the blind exercise with stakeholders. Explain how both were consolidated.

The stakeholders had a very clear view and expectations about each GS SD indicator. They scored 9 out of 12 as "positive".

As explained in Section C.3.i, as compared to the project participant, the stakeholders evaluated 'Other pollutants', 'Access to affordable and clean energy services' and 'Balance of payments and investment' as 'positive', such that the blind exercise with stakeholders resulted in a higher positive evaluation of the SD indicators. As mentioned in Section C.3.i, very interestingly, the stakeholder insisted in scoring (i) 'Other pollutants' as 'positive' since the wind turbines will protect their village from the sandstorms from Sahara, and they also insisted in setting (ii) 'Balance of payments and investment' as 'positive' since, even in a small size, they had the opinion that the project will positively contribute to the net EUR savings from the substitution of natural gas, imported from abroad.

However, these issues were very intensively discussed between the stakeholders and the project participant. The project participant could persuade the stakeholders that their opinion is right and should be emphasized, however, due to the GS rules and guidelines, it is difficult to measure, quantify and monitor these SD indicators by suitable quantitative parameters, and therefore, to be more precautionary (i.e. more conservative), it is more suitable to set these SD indicators as 'neutral'.

According to the active discussion between the stakeholders and the project participant, the consolidated sustainable development matrix had been finalized, according to the suggested matrix by the project participant, which included the precautionary approach.

As result, the consolidated matrix in Section D.3 below resulted.

### D. 3. Consolidated sustainable development matrix

#### [See Toolkit 2.4.2]

Indicator	Mitigation measure	Relevance to achieving MDG	Chosen parameter and explanation	Preliminary score
-----------	-----------------------	-------------------------------	--	----------------------



Gold Standard indicators of sustainable development	If relevant, copy mitigation measure from 'Do No Harm' assessment, and include mitigation measure used to neutralise a score of '-'	Check www.undp.org/ mdg and www.mdgmonit or.org Describe how your indicator is related to local MDG goals	Defined by project developer	Negative impact: score '-' in case negative impact is not fully mitigated, score '0' in case impact is planned to be fully mitigated <u>No change in impact</u> : score '0' <u>Positive impact</u> : score '+'
Air quality	N.A.	MDG- 7: Ensure Environment Sustainability: 7.A. Integrate the principles of sustainable development into country policies and programmes and reverse the loss of environmental resources.	Parameter: - Yearly electricity production in MWh; - Avoided amount of SOx and NOx; - Dust emissions during construction phase; - Emissions from construction machines during construction machines during construction phase The project will avoid SOx and NOx emissions	0



and other
emission types
such as PM
(Particulates) or
VOC , which
otherwise
would have
been released
by fossil fuel
fired power
plants, in the
baseline. Thus,
the air quality
of the region,
as compared to
the baseline
will be
improved.
improved.
However,
during the
construction
phase a
negligible
amount of
emission from
construction
machines and
dust emissions
during the
whole
construction
phase will
occur. These all
will be
managed
according to
"Circular
Exhaust
Emission
Measurements"
<sup>26</sup> and
"Regulation on
Excavation
Construction
and Demolition

<sup>26</sup> <u>http://www.csb.gov.tr/db/denizli/icerikbelge/icerikbelge314.pdf</u>

			Waste Control <sup>"27</sup> . Therefore, the project's contribution to the improvement of the air quality for the region is considered as neutral as precautionary approach.	
Water quality and quantity	N.A.	MDG- 7: Ensure Environmental Sustainability: 7.C. Reduce by half the proportion of people without sustainable access to safe drinking water and basic sanitation	Parameter: N.A. As compared to the baseline, there will be no impact on any water resources and quality.	0
Soil condition	N.A.	MDG- 7: Ensure Environment Sustainability: 7.A. Integrate the principles of sustainable development into country policies and programmes and reverse the loss of environmental resources.	Parameter: N.A. As compared to the baseline, there will be no impact on the soil condition of the region. According to PIF, the project is located in a region where agriculture is not possible. It is guaranteed	0

<sup>27</sup> <u>http://www.mevzuat.gov.tr/Metin.Aspx?MevzuatKod=7.5.5401&MevzuatIliski=0&sourceXmlSearch=</u>

			that soil erosion will not occur. Furthermore, the excavated soil during construction will be re-used for raising grass again.	
Other pollutants	N.A.	MDG- 7: Ensure Environment Sustainability: 7.B. Reduce biodiversity loss, achieving, by 2010, a significant reduction in the rate of loss.	Parameter: N.A. As compared to the baseline, no other pollutants will result. The project will not have any negative effects on the closest settlement area, shadow flicker and electro- magnetic impacts. The transmission / distribution lines have no impact on destruction of vegetation nor on expropriation of land.	0
Biodiversity	N.A.	MDG- 7: Ensure Environment Sustainability: 7.B. Reduce biodiversity loss, achieving, by 2010, a significant	Parameter: N.A. As compared to the baseline, there will be no change in biodiversity (species and	0





reduction in the	habitat	
rate of loss.	conservation).	
	In no case, the	
	young trees and	
	seedlings in the	
	project area will	
	be cut, but only	
	removed from	
	their place with	
	the appropriate	
	technology and	
	planted in a	
	new location	
	nominated by	
	the Directorate	
	of Forestry.	
	However, trees	
	that cannot be	
	disassembled	
	and removed to	
	another place will be cut; this	
	will only be a	
	negligible	
	amount.	
	The project	
	area is not	
	located on bird	
	migration	
	route.	
	In the region,	
	there are no	
	faunal and	
	floral species,	
	as written and	
	defied in the	
	Bern	
	Agreement	
	9/1/1984,	
	which have to	
	be protected by	
	law. Or, in	
	other words, all	
	the faunal and	
	floral species in	





			the project area, reported in detail in the PIF, are not in the list of the Bern Agreement.	
Quality of employment	N.A.	MDG-1: <u>Eradicate</u> <u>extreme poverty</u> <u>&amp; hunger:</u> 1.B. Achieve full and productive employment and decent work for all, including women and young people.	Parameter: - Number of issued certificates by the suppliers for the trainings on operation and maintenance (O&M) of the project equipment and units; - Number of health and safety trainings; Health and safety trainings for all the employees will be provided by the project owner. The employees will also be trained in O&M of the project equipment and units by the machinery and equipment supplier. These jobs will have a significant impact on job quality,	+





Livelihood of the poor	N.A.	MDG-1: <u>Eradicate</u> <u>extreme poverty</u> <u>&amp; hunger:</u> 1.A. Reduce by half the proportion of people living on less than \$1 a day.	Parameter: N.A. As compared to the baseline, the project will have no impact on the livelihood of the poor in terms of access to health care services, access to sanitation services etc.	0
Access to affordable and clean energy services	N.A.	MDG- 7: Ensure Environment Sustainability: 7.A. Integrate the principles of sustainable development into country policies and programmes and reverse the loss of environmental resources. 7.2 CO2 emissions, total, per capita and per \$1 GDP (PPP)	Parameter: Amount of clean energy generated per year in MWh; The project will inject clean energy to the grid and therefore positively contribute to the decrease of the grids emission factor. This will improve the region's access to clean energy which is not possible in the baseline scenario of distributing fossil fuel based quantity of electricity. The project will also positively contribute to	+



Human and institutional capacity	N.A.	MDG-1: <u>Eradicate</u> <u>extreme poverty</u> <u>&amp; hunger:</u> 1.A. Reduce by half the proportion of people living on less than \$1 a day.	the reduction of dependency on fuel and energy imports. Parameter: - Number of voluntary public awareness meetings for local stakeholders; The project will yearly provide voluntary public awareness meetings for local stakeholders. In these meetings the last status / developments on global climate change, carbon markets and the status of the project will be discussed with the objective of regularly informing the local stakeholders and proving a common panel for discussion.	+
Quantitative employment and income generation	N.A.	<u>MDG- 1:</u> <u>Eradicate</u> <u>extreme poverty</u> <u>&amp; hunger:</u> 1.A. Reduce by half the proportion of people living on	Parameter: Number of people with an employment contract / pay roll; The project will provide	+



		less than \$1 a day.	employment opportunities during the construction as well as the operation phase of the plant.	
Balance of payments and investment	N.A.	MDG- 8: Develop a global partnership for development: 8.D. Deal comprehensively with the debt problems of developing countries.	Parameter: Avoided quantity of natural gas to be imported and the corresponding saved monetary value per year; The project will positively contribute to the replacement of fossil fuels and net foreign currency savings related to natural gas imports by shifting some of electricity generation away from natural gas towards using internally available renewable sources. However, due to its relatively small size, the project's contribution is assumed not to have a	0



		MDG 8: Dovelop	significant impact on Turkey's balance of payments and investment (conservativene ss).	
Technology transfer and technological self-reliance	N.A.	MDG- 8: Develop a global partnership for development: 8.F. In cooperation with the private sector, make available the benefits of new technologies, especially information and communications.	Parameter: N.A. The project will not have any contribution with regard to technology transfer and technological self-reliance for Turkey.	0

### Justification choices, data source and provision of references

A justification paragraph and reference source is required for each indicator, regardless of score

Air quality	The project will avoid fossil fuel combustion and therefore, partially substitute electricity generation from fossil fuel fired power plants that represent a large share of the Turkish grid generation mix. As a result, the corresponding air emissions, respectively, will be significantly reduced, which otherwise would be produced by average (mainly coal fired) grid connected power plant in the baseline. The project will result in no SOx and NOx emissions and other emission types such as CO, PM (Particulates) or VOC.
	However, during the construction phase a negligible amount of emission from construction machines and dust emissions during the whole construction phase will occur.

	These all will be managed according to "Circular Exhaust Emission Measurements" <sup>28</sup> and "Regulation on Excavation Construction and Demolition Waste Control" <sup>29</sup> .
	As a result, to apply the precautionary principle, the project's contribution to the improvement of the air quality for the region is considered as neutral, i.e., as '0'.
Water quality and quantity	The project is not located to any ground or underground water sources. Thus, the project will have no impact, as compared to the baseline. There will only be negligible amount of waste water, caused by the workers at the facility. However, this waste water will not released to the ground water and managed according to "Regulation on Control of Water Contamination" <sup>30</sup> . During the operation of the facility, the domestic waste water, caused by the employees in the facility, will be collected in a sealed septic tank and then discharged to a location, determined by the local authority.
	Therefore, the SD indicator is scored with '0' taking into account the neutral impact of the proposed project activities on water quality and quantity and thus, is not be monitored.
Soil condition	The project has received all relevant licenses from various authorities and thus, is not located in an agricultural or erosion-sensitive area. Since wind energy is an environmental-friendly technology that does not incorporate any soil pollution with lead, SOx, NOx, cadmium or mercury, as compared to the baseline situation, there will no impact on soil. The project participant will use 2 MW wind turbines such that excavation work will be relatively less, as compared to small-sized wind turbines. All the excavation work will be conducted in line with "Regulation on Excavation and Construction Work" <sup>31</sup> . Thus, its impact will be negligible. According to PIF <sup>32</sup> , the project is located in a region where agriculture is not possible by nature. It is guaranteed that soil erosion will not occur. Furthermore, the excavated soil during construction will be re-used for raising grass again.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> <u>http://www.csb.gov.tr/db/denizli/icerikbelge/icerikbelge314.pdf</u>

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> http://www.mevzuat.gov.tr/Metin.Aspx?MevzuatKod=7.5.5401&MevzuatIliski=0&sourceXmlSearch=
 <sup>30</sup> http://www2.cevreorman.gov.tr/yasa/y/25687.docx
 <sup>31</sup> http://www2.cevreorman.gov.tr/yasa/y/25406.doc
 <sup>32</sup> Project Introduction File (PIF) "Adares Wind Power Plant".



	Therefore, the SD indicator is scored with '0' taking into account the neutral impact of the proposed project activities on soil condition and thus, is not be monitored.
Other pollutants	The project activity will use renewable energy as energy source and therefore does not involve any negative contribution to other pollutants types, such as excessive noise during construction, or the usage of any toxic chemicals or radioactive elements or ozone depleting substances in the plant operation.
	The project will not have any negative effects on the closest settlement area, which is Acarlar Village, 1.450m away from the nearest turbine. During construction phase the noise level will be 37dBA, which is far below the regulatory limit of 70dBA, defined in the "Regulation on Assessment and Management of Environmental Noise" <sup>33</sup> . Furthermore, due to the distance of 1.450m of the nearest turbine the closest settlement area, Acarlar village as well as the close surrounded area which is not agriculture land, the project will not have any negatively affects with regard to shadow flickers.
	According to PIF <sup>34</sup> , precautions are met to ensure that the positioning of the wind turbines does not affect transmission systems in the vicinity.
	The transmission / distribution lines have no impact on destruction of vegetation nor on expropriation of land. These are guaranteed through regulations that the location to be invested has to be a fully non-protected area and by receiving permissions and opinion letters from various authorities. In addition to that, by law, transmission / distribution lines are only allowed to be set on expropriated land.
	As a result, the SD indicator is scored with '0' taking into account the neutral impact of the proposed project activities on other pollutants and thus, is not be monitored.
Biodiversity	The project is not located in a biodiversity-sensitive area. The project area is neither a nature-protected area, nor are there any sensitive genes, species and/or habitats existing within the project boundary. That is, in the region, there are no faunal and floral species, as written and

<sup>33</sup> <u>http://www.mevzuat.gov.tr/Metin.Aspx?MevzuatKod=7.5.14012&MevzuatIliski=0&sourceXmlSearch=</u> <sup>34</sup> Project Introduction File (PIF) "Adares Wind Power Plant".

	defined in the Bern Agreement 9/1/1984, which have to be protected by law. Or, in other words, all the faunal and floral species in the project area, reported in detail in the PIF, are not in the list of the Bern Agreement.
	According to PIF <sup>35</sup> , in no case, the young trees and seedlings in the project area will be cut, but only removed from their place with the appropriate technology and planted in a new location nominated by the Directorate of Forestry. However, trees that cannot be disassembled and removed to another place will be cut; this will only be a negligible amount. The project area is not located on bird migration route.
	Therefore, the sustainable indicator is scored with '0,' taking into account the neutral impact of the proposed project activities on the local biodiversity and thus, is not be monitored.
Quality of employment	Through the project activity, employment will be created during the construction and operation phase of the plant.
	The project participant guarantees following issues:
	<ul> <li>Health and safety trainings for all the employees in the facility;</li> <li>Training of the employees in O&amp;M of the project equipment and units will be provided by the machinery and equipment supplier.</li> </ul>
	These will have a significant impact on job quality.
	All the health and safety trainings will be in line with the regulations of the Turkish Ministry of Labour and Social Security <sup>36,37</sup> .
	Therefore, the sustainable indicator is scored with '+' taking into account the positive impact of the proposed project activities on quality of employment. This will be yearly monitored in the Sustainability Monitoring Plan by the project participant.
Livelihood of the poor	The project activity will create extra job opportunities, especially for the local young people, and provide them with a living for their families. They will be provided by social security such that their health control situation,

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup> Project Introduction File (PIF) "Adares Wind Power Plant".
 <sup>36</sup> <u>http://www.isguvenligi.net/mevzuat/4857\_isig\_yonetmelikleri/is\_sagligi\_ve\_guvenligi\_yonetmeligi.pdf</u>
 <sup>37</sup> <u>http://www.mevzuat.adalet.gov.tr/html/5115.html</u>

	<ul> <li>pension salary and living standard can be improved. All the stakeholders in agreed that the proposed project activity will have a positive contribution also for unskilled workers during the construction phase who will earn money for the living of their families.</li> <li>However, according to GS V2.2 Annex-I guidelines, the project will not have any impacts with regard to access to health care services, access to sanitation services etc.</li> <li>As a result, the sustainable indicator is scored with '0' taking into account the neutral impact of the proposed project activities on livelihood of the poor and thus, is not monitored.</li> </ul>
Access to affordable and clean energy services	According to TEIAS 2011 statistics, 45% of Turkey's energy generation is dependent on natural gas <sup>38</sup> . However, natural gas is not a resource which is nationally available in Turkey such that it has to be imported from abroad such as Iran or Russia, resulting in a foreign dependence on fuel and uncertainty of energy supply in Turkey.
	As agreed by the stakeholders, since with this project, a more sustainable and affordable energy services as well as a positive contribution to the security of energy supply in Turkey will be reached, and the successful implementation of the this project will contribute to the increased use of the renewable energy in Turkey's energy mix.
	Therefore, the sustainable indicator is scored with '+' taking into account the positive impact of the proposed project activities on access to affordable and clean energy services. This will be yearly monitored in the Sustainability Monitoring Plan by the project participant.
Human and institutional capacity	The project owner commits himself to provide voluntary public awareness meetings for local stakeholders. In these meetings the last status / developments on global climate change, carbon markets and the status of the project will be discussed with the objective of regularly informing the local stakeholders and proving a common panel for discussion.
	Therefore, the sustainable indicator is scored with '+' taking into account the positive impact of the proposed project activities on human and institutional capacity. This will be yearly monitored in the Sustainability Monitoring

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> <u>http://www.teias.gov.tr/T%C3%BCrkiyeElektrik%C4%B0statistikleri/istatistik2011/istatistik%202011.htm</u>



	Plan by the project participant.
Quantitative employment and income generation	The project activity will create employment opportunities for workers during the construction and operation phase of the facility. Furthermore, local contracting companies will also be receive works from the project participant and thus generate income during the construction and operation phase.
	Therefore, the sustainable indicator is scored with '+' taking into account the positive impact of the proposed project activities on quantitative employment and income generation. This will be yearly monitored in the Sustainability Monitoring Plan by the project participant.
Balance of payments and investment	Although the project activity will have a positive contribution to the foreign fuel dependency and net savings in foreign currency, even if this is a gratifying situation, its contribution to Turkey's balance of payments and investment is still too little such that it can be neglected.
	Therefore, the SD indicator is scored with '0' taking into account the neutral impact of the proposed project activities on soil condition and thus, is not be monitored.
Technology transfer and technological self-reliance	Wind energy technology has become a well-known and technology type in Turkey, which however is mainly imported from abroad. The proposed project activity will use new types of wind turbines, and positively contribute the technology transfer in Turkey and help Turkey's sector to develop self-reliance. However, this issue is very difficult to measure, quantify and monitor.
	Therefore, the SD indicator is scored with '0' taking into account the neutral impact of the proposed project activities on technology transfer and technological self-reliance and thus, is not be monitored.

References can be an academic or non-academic source, such as a university research document, a feasibility study report, EIA, relevant website, etc.

**SECTION E.** 

SUSTAINABILITY MONITORING PLAN

E. 1. Discussion on Sustainability monitoring Plan



#### [See Toolkit 2.4.3 and 2.6.1]

Discuss stakeholders' ideas on monitoring sustainable development indicators. Do people have ideas on how this could be done in a cost effective way? Are there ways in which stakeholders can participate in monitoring?

During the GS Stakeholders Meeting, there was an intensive and very fruitful discussion about the monitoring of the GS sustainable development indicators. As mentioned in the previous section, the stakeholders had very clear views, ideas and expectations about the monitoring of the consolidated indicators. The stakeholders and the project participant shared the same views about the yearly Sustainability Monitoring Plan.

By the start of the operation in line with the Gold Standard v2.2 requirements the following positively scored SD indicators with the corresponding parameter will be calculated, monitored and reported:

1. Quality of employment:

Parameter: Number of health and safety trainings for the workers in the facility; Number of issued certificates by the suppliers for the trainings on operation and maintenance (O&M) of the project equipment and units;

2. Human and institutional capacity:

Parameter: Number of voluntarily provided meetings and presentations, given by the project participant to the local people, with regard to increase of public awareness;

- 3. Access to affordable and clean energy services:
  - Parameter: Amount of clean energy generated per year in MWh;
- 4. Quantitative employment and income generation:

Parameter: Number of people with an employment contract / pay roll;

The project participant will calculate, measure, archive and report, respectively, the SD indicators on own cost. However, the project owner ensures to put best effort to involve the local stakeholders for participating in monitoring of the project including such muhtars and villagers. In addition to the own measures and calculations, the project owner especially will also consider other complementary tools of monitoring such as interviews of the local people about noise, feedback or log book to be kept at muhtar offices and publicly accessible places. The local stakeholders have also be informed and motivated that they are always welcome to use the initiative of the continuous input / grievance mechanism, which will be explained in next Section E.2.

#### E. 2. Discussion on continuous input / grievance mechanism



	Method Chosen (include all known details e.g. location of book, phone, number, identity of mediator)	Justification
Continuous Input / Grievance Expression Process Book	Continuous Input / Grievance Expression Process Book will be placed at Mukhtar Office of Sultaniye Village Addreess: Sultaniye Köyü Muhtarlığı, Sultaniye/Selçuk/İzmir	The closest settlement to the project area is Sultaniye Village.
Telephone access	Representative of The Project Investor Mustafa R. Esen +90 224 411 03 04 <u>The Gold Standard</u> <u>Foundation</u> <u>Turkey Office:</u> Ms. Bahar Ubay +90 312 426 30 61	In order to give feedback directly to the investor, phone number of the representative was shared and as the independent authority phone number of the representative of The Gold Standard Foundation was shared.
Internet/email access	Web: <u>http://www.fcenerji.com.tr/</u> E-mail: <u>mrifatesen@fcenerji.com.tr</u> and <u>fcenerji@fcenerji.com.tr</u>	Investor company's web site and project representative's e-mail address helps to access the responsible person and get quick response
Nominated Independent Mediator (optional)	N.A.	N.A.

All issues identified during the crediting period through any of the Methods shall have a mitigation measure in place. The identified issue should be discussed in the revised Passport and the corresponding mitigation measure should be added to sustainability monitoring plan



### SECTION F. DESCRPTION OF THE DESIGN OF THE STAKEHOLDER FEEDBACK ROUND

After submission of the LSC Report to The Gold Standard Foundation, the process of completing the final PDD and GS Passport will be started. As soon as these documents are completed, the Stakeholder Feedback Round and Validation will be initiated.

During the 2 months of the Stakeholder Feedback Round the Turkish summary of the LSC Report and the English version of the LSC Report, PDD and GS Passport will be available on Green Consult and Finance website or investor's website We have informed the stakeholders about the Stakeholder Feedback Round at the LSC meeting. We shared the website address of Green Consult and Finance in the Non-Technical Summary text. Furthermore, for those people and/or institutions who do not have internet access, hard copies of the documents will be sent to Mukhtars of Sultaniye, Acarlar and Çamlık Villages . The documents will be available for at least two months before validation is completed.



### ANNEX 1.

#### **ORIGINAL PARTICIPANTS LIST**

Adı, Soyadı/ Mesleği	Cinsiyeti	Imza	Çalıştığı	İletişim Bilgileri	
	(Kadın- Erkek)		Kurum/Kuruluş	,	
Lluxalo 21 St Fren	Ertek	John -	FC Energy	0 554 346 4810	
faruk Batur	Ellete	Aught	FC Energi	0 224 411 0504	
Mehmet Baller	tad ertel	AB	YGT	0537 388 6704	
Prat Guin		-Pan-	Ambulas	892 3665	<b>.</b> .
Adran ER	AN _		Esnal	0.536981323	36
Misfala Durch	Erbel	Re 1	TEOAS	05063092605	
ME	Sayy	na	GIGGI	05057296438	
MiAL Tut	gun B	En Cr.	Sife	05392940530	
Sabahattan	Seygn	SHUR	CICLCI	0532 506 2982	
Ali Cinba	1 - 20	365	CARTCH	-	
65MGH demine	as Erkd	- An-	GifGi		
	17 ····	<u></u>			
Useyin Oztar	Ecker	E LET :	G:f C1	892 2904	
ESAt Pajatta		and a	Gifqi_		
Mellen Baglat		that	GifGi	/	
Meliny Daylar	tere bal				
BRAITTA EDLER	BATANS	S M	SANATE )	05422832843	
1 1 1	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	par got	17		
KURT KOFFE	Erlick	h-alhaet	KIZGUM	-71	
Nesla Gornor	Kadin	N.C	Cisai	•	
Enine Bahcebah	m Kasin	V. N	c:fci	····	
Pomencip Real		- Bill	musstar	0506 3717561	
Hyton Solom	k Ertek	not	Gifty'	0536 517-67-22	
Hasun Son	107	AR.	Cife!	892 8817	
Haunittin	Buz	2to	1301	892 08 08	
Ogen Ye	silcim	en des	Eshaf	03378672292	,
Semo Maril	<u>hinen</u>	Aur	AKPARINGE	05316605939	
ibrohn slepton	Een	hun -	BEC -	05787172761	
Harm AL Alle	d ber	au	4 4	0532-4875014	
Fun Kar	Why Fr		Emeklin	05425129679	
-34/					
				,, _,	
L			•		

e se conqu

.



ANNEX 2.

.

#### ORIGINAL EVALUATION FORMS

## Evaluation form #1

Adı-Soyadı	HASSN AN AUBEYOGU
Toplantı ile ilgili izlenimleriniz nelerdir?	Jojet desnile, norden kæstebe dintegen ædriegen lærdere eta ædilede energrun denve verser ve iscorenço haldennde geveleer bilgi
Projenin hangi yönlerini beğendiniz?	Theye tener (pertebestion) erer koren der inde en dorot, nologet ette estimeri, genage "larer un 5' has ous begen lung geren da
Projeni hangi yönlerini beğenmediniz?	
Imza	

Adi-Soyadi Semo Desilai men Toplanti ile ilgili izlenimleriniz nelerdir?	AKPARTI ILGE BSK
Toplantı ile ilgili izlenimleriniz nelerdir?	
Cokverimli birdoplantio dui	Junu düsünyorun
Projenin hangi yönlerini beğendiniz?	
linibunteen Orman wet	onine arazileni üzeninde olması
Sole onenli Jakeenilin hat	and sold with meaning opprast
ôzel mi li yet elentermin i	lorine sizer ler, uzerine omnes, loringen ve safet merkezlerininde inde ve arerinde olmos önerdider,
Projeni nangi yonierini begenmediniz?	
- quire to rumole of mole	insonlar un sizerin de konsorejon
ettilerinin dramesigere	en
Imza	



### Evaluation form #3

Adı-Soyadı	Abrolian Slegon
Toplantı ile ilgili izlenimleriniz nelerdir?	Toplarty antertan (Juan) articidasser, transma traling other man featterning up of teatrolome
Projenin hangi yönlerini beğendiniz?	lar.
	var uetervir eremje Selvip obrek gloads andeele Mibis adran.
	mibis adren.
Projeni hangi yönlerini beğenmediniz?	
Imza	an

Adı-Soyadı	Spielgett	e Fdle	~ Kurt	KOP.	TA	
Foplantı ile ilgili iz	lenimleriniz nelerdir?					
Echt lä	ssig-wink	10,				
Projenin hangi yö	nlerini beğendiniz?					
Projeni hangi yön	lerini beğenmediniz?					
Imza 12	in theirs	to				



.

## Evaluation form #5

·				 
Adi-Soyadı Dyn Fgette	Fd	1e/	 	
BILGI ALIYORUZ VE ÖGRENİYORUZ				
OFRENIYORUZ	1			
Projenin hangi yönlerini beğendiniz?				
Projeni hangi yönlerini beğenmediniz?		<u>.</u>	 	
imza 20. H Ol			 <u></u>	
Dill a m			 	 ]

Adı-Soyadı	ellustatio Suborg
Toplantı ile ilgili izlenimleriniz nelerdir?	Carrier for the contract
Occurrent	
Projenin hangi yönlerini beğendiniz?	
CERCE	
Projeni hangi yönlerini beğenmediniz?	
	Bibleje insammen fogdalourbelue için Tepascus sinter Thirty Amasu si ile exectinik Faturacamung ür ner museum
	S' ile élektrik Faturacamy
Imza Million	LICERT THASIMAGE CAPICA RICIL UN



. 7

### Evaluation form #7

· . . .

Adi-Soyadi Hasan Sange Z		
i opianti ile ligili izlenimleriniz nelerdir?	Bilgi amach	
	older of the	
	Bilgi amaçlı oldugu için bilgilendim	-
Projenin hangi yönlerini beğendiniz?	e	
	yatirim amaçlı olduğu İçim	
	line	
Projeni hangi yönlerini beğenmediniz?		
Tojeni nangi yonenni begennediniz:		
mza		

Adi-Soyadı <u>E Sat Baytat tav</u> Toplantı ile ilgili izlenimleriniz nelerdir?	Bilgi amaçlı o bil gilen dirs	ldogu iGin
Projenin hangi yönlerini beğendiniz?	Votivim amag Oldo go igin	11
Projeni hangi yönlerini beğenmediniz?		i
Imza Clevet		- · · ·



. . *1* 

## Evaluation form #9

Adi-Soyadi Ogan Yezilain.	c~	
Image: Coplanti ile ilgili izlenimleriniz nelerdir?       Image: Comparent ile ilgili		
Projenin hangi yönlerini beğendiniz?		
rojeni hangi yönlerini beğenmediniz?	-	 
Yasisin Amachi Olmasi		
nza		 

di-Soyadi Haynistin Du	~
olumla	
Projenin hangi yönlerini beğendiniz?	Temiz olmosi Gerneye zonan li olmamos
Projeni hangi yönlerini beğenmediniz?	Yorum Yok
mza dates	



. . A. . .

## Evaluation form #11

Adi-Soyadi Caracazan Carte 7	
Adi-Soyadi Camazan SENEC7 Toplanti ile ilgili izlenimleriniz nelerdir?	
drible ville i la la la la la la la la la la la la la	
J I GIEIGIEWO	
laster al	
The states of the states	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
SPACE FARMA	
Toplanti ile ilgili izlenimleriniz nelerdir? Sylbly blgllendtrue Toplantisi olmustur Teseker Edesplay	
Projenin hangi yönlerini beğendiniz?	
Projeni hangi yönlerini beğenmediniz?	
Köyörnözön direk Olarak vu hizmetten	
Logurar con arec	
basak ou hizmetten	
Thu dalang manage a	
Pay dalanamannasindan	
	· [
imza K	

/
Bilgi anaqlı olduğu için bil gilenme için
Yativim amaçlı
Yatıvım amaçlı olduğu iGin
-